



Chat Transcript for Session Topic: Student input to assessment design & strategy

HEA Academy Panel Session with
Linda Creanor, Katy McCloskey, Margaret Price, & Brenda Smith

Facilitated by
Terry Mayes
Glasgow Caledonian University, Glasgow, United Kingdom

Moderated by
Sheila MacNeill
University of Strathclyde, Glasgow, United Kingdom

Date/Time	Author	Comment
31/05/2007 10:59:38	Sheila MacNeill (Sheila (Moderator))	Welcome to this session on student input to assessment design and strategy. I'd like to introduce Prof Terry Mayes as the session chair and our panelists - Linda Creanor, Katy McClosky, Prof Margaret Price & Prof Brenda Smith. Thanks to all our pane
31/05/2007 10:59:45	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	no worries = we've got everyone now
31/05/2007 11:00:09	Sheila MacNeill (Sheila (Moderator))	I'm Sheila MacNeill and I'll be your moderator for this session. Terry is going to lead the session and will start by getting each of the panel to expand a little on their papers. Then the virtual floor will be open for questions.
31/05/2007 11:00:54	Sheila MacNeill (Sheila (Moderator))	Just a wee reminder that when the discussion starts, please give the panel time to respond questions before posting another comment or question. Over to you, Terry.
31/05/2007 11:01:02	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	OK Sheila - the turntaking is going to be the problem, so I'll just start by asking each of the panelists to offer a couple of sentences about their position and to highlight one issue they would like to see discussed
31/05/2007 11:01:22	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	First can I invite Brenda to do that?
31/05/2007 11:02:05	Sheila MacNeill (Sheila (Moderator))	Hi Maddalena
31/05/2007 11:02:36	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	I am very keen to involve students as Change agents involving them in staff and educational development events. I would like any of our students to suggest ways in which they would like to be involved in the assessment process.
31/05/2007 11:02:41	Sheila MacNeill (Sheila (Moderator))	Hi klamb and gka 23 and Judy - we're just about to start
31/05/2007 11:02:54	Judy Cohen (JudyCohen)	Hi all
31/05/2007 11:03:11	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	I'm back
31/05/2007 11:03:19	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Thanks Brenda, I'll come to Katy last so she can respond to that. So Linda?
31/05/2007 11:03:23	Sheila MacNeill (Sheila (Moderator))	Hi djmatthews, welcome back Derek
31/05/2007 11:04:05	Darren Matthews (djmatthews)	Hi Sheila



31/05/2007 11:04:18	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	Yo darren!
31/05/2007 11:04:41	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	I think we're all offering a very similar position, in that we are all advocating student involvement to varying degrees. I believe that we should be involving students from the outset, in designing learning activities as well as assessments. I'm particularly interested in how learning technology can be used to enhance this process. How can we incorporate the new approaches to study our students are demonstrating?
31/05/2007 11:05:00	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Margaret?
31/05/2007 11:05:43	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	My position is that for students to truly understand the assessment process they not only have to participate in it but they must play a central role in the assessment community. Thereby building pedagogic intelligence in the way that new staff do. community
31/05/2007 11:06:13	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Finally Katy ?
31/05/2007 11:08:50	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	hello. As Linda said, we do all seem to have similar positions here. I love the idea of involving students in assessment design. I believe that choice over the type of assessment we sit, the weighting it has on our final marks, and involvement in criteria setting will lead to greater student empowerment. What I'd like to hear about would be any current examples of this type of student involvement from delegates.
31/05/2007 11:09:37	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	OK lets open it out to the delegates for a few moments. Anyone offer a current example?
31/05/2007 11:09:39	Sheila MacNeill (Sheila (Moderator))	Hi MahaBali
31/05/2007 11:09:44	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	What do we see as the limits of student involvement, e.g. suppose a student says I want to concentrate on such-and-such aspects of the course and I prefer to be assessed by an end-of-course examination only"?
31/05/2007 11:09:52	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	(sorry i'm late - 5 a.m.)
31/05/2007 11:10:23	Sheila MacNeill (Sheila (Moderator))	no apologies needed - we're just about to open out the discussion
31/05/2007 11:11:37	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Before this session started Sue Saltmarsh had pointed to the problem that I think Derek is raising - that students have been taught to be very instrumental in their approach, so they may not engage at the level we need?
31/05/2007 11:12:24	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	Really, Terry, I'm asking whether we can contemplate individualised assessment?
31/05/2007 11:12:30	Mark Russell (MarkRussell)	Thanks for the statements and Hi, and, before I offer an example, tag another point to Dereks Q'. How adept are our students at making such informed choices (Devils Advocate)
31/05/2007 11:12:37	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Any have views on this -engaging students at the level that will lead to deep learning, not surface?
31/05/2007 11:12:46	Andy Sharp (AndySharp)	What about asking students as part of the process to illustrate the type of feedback comments that are valuable to them as well as having input into assessment design?
31/05/2007 11:12:52	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	That is, might different students choose different forms of assessment?
31/05/2007 11:13:18	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	i think the key thing is what Derek said: difference and choice
31/05/2007 11:13:27	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	I think we need to put a framework on all of this if it is to work with large groups of students



31/05/2007 11:13:39	Geetha Abeysinghe (gka23)	Derek: I think we need to give a framework within which the students can work. for example, if they asked for an end of semester examination and the univeristy system does not allow, this can cause a negative attitude.
31/05/2007 11:13:47	David Nicol (DavidNicol)	Maybe not but they could add extra criteria that are important to them, Derek
31/05/2007 11:13:51	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	can you say more Brenda - what would a framework achieve?
31/05/2007 11:14:16	Sheila MacNeill (Sheila (Moderator))	hi cchao
31/05/2007 11:14:31	Chin-chi Chao (cchao)	Hi...
31/05/2007 11:14:45	Chin-chi Chao (cchao)	Thanks for your greeting.
31/05/2007 11:15:01	Sheila MacNeill (Sheila (Moderator))	Hi Colin
31/05/2007 11:15:08	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	Perhaps a negative attitude would be justified if they are mistakenly led to believe we are sharing the power with them?
31/05/2007 11:15:19	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	Yes, we still have to comply with quality reguaktions and internal assesment procedures, which restricts the level of flexibility and empowerment we can offer. However by involving students more at policy level, as Katy is currently doing, this may help to persuade senior mnagement that more flexibility is required. I agree with Brenda that this still needs to be within some kind of agreed framework.
31/05/2007 11:15:27	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	We'll need to focus. can we deal with the problem Derek has raised.
31/05/2007 11:15:36	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Derek: I thought we were sharing the power... kind of a critical pedagogy
31/05/2007 11:15:38	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	A paramater withi which students could choose. For example a range of essay titles could be suggested by studnets and the group of students agree if they fit within teh learning outcomes. If they do then the students can choose.
31/05/2007 11:16:17	David Nicol (DavidNicol)	choice and structure are not incompatible
31/05/2007 11:16:28	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	How about individual projects within a course, Brenda?
31/05/2007 11:16:33	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	can I ask - can we engage students in agreeing the learning outcomes. Is this a prior step?
31/05/2007 11:16:34	Mark Russell (MarkRussell)	Brenda - I like that - A limited choice but that is personal to them
31/05/2007 11:16:36	Chin-chi Chao (cchao)	Students-selected materials can be parts of the effective materials to be used in the classroom.....
31/05/2007 11:16:38	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Brenda: the PEW foundation had some case studies like that some years ago, called this the "buffet" method
31/05/2007 11:17:03	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	PEW cont'd: students signed a contract with their preferred forms of assessment and weighting... then revised it once during the semester
31/05/2007 11:17:14	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	I like the idea of a buffet!
31/05/2007 11:17:34	Chin-chi Chao (cchao)	But, maybe to achieve that purpose, maybe some principles based on resaerch are needed.
31/05/2007 11:17:37	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	cchao: have been in graduate classes where this was the case; have seen undergraduate classes do this at American University in Cairo
31/05/2007 11:17:45	Mark Russell (MarkRussell)	but the buffet must satisfy a need and not allow the repeated selction of turkey twistlers



31/05/2007 11:17:46	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	But is the buffet itself the result of negotiation?
31/05/2007 11:17:59	K.P. Jaikiran (jaitvm)	MahaBali i think we should limit learner participation in assessment procedures to deciding upon the format of assessment.
31/05/2007 11:18:40	Mark Russell (MarkRussell)	Format or intended outcomes?
31/05/2007 11:18:45	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	We're not just talking about choice. We need to allow students the power to influence policy
31/05/2007 11:18:52	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	i think we might be focusing on details here when we need to look at the influence that student s have over the more philosophical questions about assessment. I f there was more dialogue about the purpose of assessment and development of common ground betw
31/05/2007 11:18:58	K.P. Jaikiran (jaitvm)	outcomes to be precise
31/05/2007 11:19:16	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	Are we talking about students deciding how everyone is to be assessed or how they personally are?
31/05/2007 11:19:23	Andy Sharp (AndySharp)	I had experience of this as a student in 1991 where the final exam was negotiated around the coursework submissions of other students the exam questions were negotiated. As a student I felt empowered. Also it encourage a great deal of peer tutoring and
31/05/2007 11:19:47	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Thanks Margaret - can everyone pause for a moment please. Can we focus on the point Margaret has raised. Let me put that to the other members of the panel
31/05/2007 11:20:00	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Linda?
31/05/2007 11:20:06	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	No not about how they are personally assessed but the role assessment should play and working with staff to work out ways to improve it and enable learning through it
31/05/2007 11:20:12	David Nicol (DavidNicol)	Also, recently I was in a group with both students and staff and the final year student had a lot to say about how the first year could be improved.
31/05/2007 11:20:15	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Derek: giving other students more power is not giving the students enough individual power, right? (not peer assessment but the decision about format)
31/05/2007 11:20:15	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	Sorry
31/05/2007 11:20:16	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	Yes, there can be different routes to demonstrating the achievement of learning outcomes. Should we be allowing for these differences? I think we have more flexibility in formative assessment, and that's a starting point for involving students more.
31/05/2007 11:20:26	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Brenda?
31/05/2007 11:21:00	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	David: can see final year students having such a "say" but not sure if first years have "anything to go by"
31/05/2007 11:22:06	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	A practical example I can give is where a number of years ago I was working with mature students who had been made redundant and wanted to train to teach. I gave them a choice of the topic. They had to list the criteria by which they wanted to be assessed and discuss with a peer. I received some fantastic project work as they were not all fighting over the same books. I realise that by the time I sent this the topic has moved on!
31/05/2007 11:22:39	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	But were they able to choose different topics, Brenda?



31/05/2007 11:23:05	David Nicol (DavidNicol)	Yes, Maha, but it is about sharing the power across the community of students, first year's might feel this sharing if they know their older peers have been involved
31/05/2007 11:23:20	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	Yes, but it had to relate to nutrition.
31/05/2007 11:23:32	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	OK - this is challenging to chair! We are focusing on the point that students should be involved in a dialogue about the purpose of the assessment - does that mean they should first understand the nature of the ILOs
31/05/2007 11:23:41	K.P. Jaikiran (jaitvm)	It's true that there will be more responsible learner behaviour. Sharing power doesn't mean total learner control
31/05/2007 11:23:50	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	Could How widely could Brenda's teacher-training example apply in other courses?
31/05/2007 11:24:02	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	David: i can see older students being thoughtful and having hindsight; what about younger students?
31/05/2007 11:24:12	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	Yes, we do need to spend time with the student explaining and ensuring they understand LOs
31/05/2007 11:24:20	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	Brenda's example is similar to the approach taken in our PgC LTHE for staff. which is by Learning Contract. Learning Goals are set, but how the students demonstrate they have achieved them is unique to each individual student. I appreciate that this format wouldn't work with large numbers.
31/05/2007 11:24:49	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	Are "LO"s learning objectives?
31/05/2007 11:24:51	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	giving students choice of topic is very common at the American University in Cairo across courses
31/05/2007 11:25:04	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Sorry - learning outcomes
31/05/2007 11:25:07	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	(at several levels)
31/05/2007 11:25:33	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	I think we should spend time inducting our students about assessment, where all we often do is explain what will happen if they fail.
31/05/2007 11:25:35	David Nicol (DavidNicol)	Maha, I have found that first years can be thoughtful if you treat them with respect.
31/05/2007 11:25:35	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	I think we need to do more than explain ILOs students will only really understand them if they have to work with them in the way that staff do and the same is true for assessment criteria
31/05/2007 11:25:42	Andy Sharp (AndySharp)	What if topic choices are generated by students this can be empowering
31/05/2007 11:25:43	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Can I bring Katy in here. Everyone let Katy - our student - have a word please.
31/05/2007 11:25:49	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Linda: why not, you could have an "assistant" work with them more closely
31/05/2007 11:25:56	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	Choice of topic means that assessment is to some extent individualised. Now how about individualising the FORM of assessment?
31/05/2007 11:26:20	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	I agree with Margaret - they need experience and practice at using LO
31/05/2007 11:26:34	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	I think individualising the form of assessment is an interesting idea.
31/05/2007 11:26:38	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	Maha Bali: yes, but it would be very time intensive.
31/05/2007 11:26:45	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	David - good point; expectations affect the way they behave
31/05/2007 11:27:23	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Derek: individualizing "form" is that "buffet" format - there are e.g. 10 ways to get assessed, choose 2-5 and pick the weighting



31/05/2007 11:27:29	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	although that limits the forms to only 10
31/05/2007 11:28:05	Mark Russell (MarkRussell)	Katy -sorry did not pick up that you were a student. How committed do you think your peers would be to create 'assessment for them' - that is learning oriented too?
31/05/2007 11:28:09	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Brenda: again, can younger students who are not yet acquainted with the discipline, etc. participate in creating LO's they've no idea about?
31/05/2007 11:28:50	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	There's a pause. Perhaps we could relate this discussion to the fundamental constructivist point of allowing students to play the role of teachers. What do people feel about peer assessment in this context?
31/05/2007 11:28:50	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	We all learn in different ways, and as I said in my brief paper, why should I be penalised because the assessment happens to be in the form of an essay, if I am not too good at them? I may have learned the most information from anyone in the class, but if I cant put this across effectively in an essay format, then its been a bit pointless in terms of official recognition of achievement
31/05/2007 11:28:59	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Linda: time intensive, that's why I said have an "assistant" (e.g. several older students) work with them - saves time for the professor
31/05/2007 11:29:31	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	Some HEIs are offering students that are disabled a choice. Eg a presentation or an essay. the current view would say that a choice like this should be offered to all so that the disabled student and others do not feel set apart.
31/05/2007 11:29:31	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Katy: but there is one question we have not tackled - do we want students to be "stuck" in their zone of proximal development?
31/05/2007 11:30:05	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	do we want some of our students to graduate WITHOUT having developed certain skills (e.g. essay-writing) that may be essential to the workplace in their discipline?
31/05/2007 11:30:12	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	MahaBali: yes, and it could be part of an accredited learning activity for the more experienced students
31/05/2007 11:30:25	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	you also need to challenge students out of their comfort zone
31/05/2007 11:30:30	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	To reply to MahaBali. I think they need practice at using ones before they can set their own
31/05/2007 11:30:43	radu catalin (karadu)	I do not think that working with older students is efficient for assessment
31/05/2007 11:30:51	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Linda: I like that; especially for disciplines where such advising is relevant (e.g. education)
31/05/2007 11:31:14	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Bredna: agree; Karadu, why not "Efficient"?
31/05/2007 11:31:36	Mark Russell (MarkRussell)	maha - thats why I said choic should not allow the repeated selection of a turkey twister
31/05/2007 11:31:43	Kenji Lamb (klamb)	Maha: Do you think that the essay format is reflective of the lecturer's comfort zone?
31/05/2007 11:31:50	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	Please tell Katy that, judging by her position paper, there is nothing wrong with her essay writing skills!
31/05/2007 11:32:01	Mark Russell (MarkRussell)	here here
31/05/2007 11:32:02	David Nicol (DavidNicol)	All this worry about summative assessment assumes that it is always valid and reliably assessed.
31/05/2007 11:32:15	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Mark: aaahhh didn't know what a Turkey twister was hehehe
31/05/2007 11:32:26	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	Can we bring in Katy to talk about some of her experiences or those of other students?



31/05/2007 11:32:31	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	klamb: great point!
31/05/2007 11:32:32	radu catalin (karadu)	because older students have their own approach for learning and outcomes will not be the one that you expect
31/05/2007 11:32:45	Darren Matthews (djmatthews)	Maha, I agree it's important for students to develop a wide range of skills - essay writing, presentations etc, but should the student be able to decide the weighting of each depending on his/her strengths ?
31/05/2007 11:32:52	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	katy?
31/05/2007 11:33:16	K.P. Jaikiran (jaitvm)	When assessment formats are individualised and learner friendly how do we ensure that the LOs are achieved
31/05/2007 11:33:17	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	sorry I am finding it a bit hard to keep up here, ive been asked about 4 questions and I can't type as fast as I usually talk. give me a sec!
31/05/2007 11:33:44	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	Going back to my position paper, I think we need to approach this more radically. If students are learning through social networking, sharing digital resources and creating content, we should start to look beyond traditional assessment modes. Approaches to study are changing, but assessment modes are not. and
31/05/2007 11:33:47	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Everybody pause a moment please. I'll go to the panel members in turn
31/05/2007 11:33:52	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	jaitv: how do you ensure LO
31/05/2007 11:33:55	Steve Draper (SteveDraper)	(I see we've cleverly selected a medium to keep the student silenced!)
31/05/2007 11:34:16	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Jaitv: how do you ensure LO are met when the instructor forces a certain format? you don't because some students will NOT learn
31/05/2007 11:34:18	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	Terry can you also let me know which point you want me to respond to - there are so many!
31/05/2007 11:34:29	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Katy - would you like someone to summarize the questions for you?
31/05/2007 11:34:31	David Nicol (DavidNicol)	and manipulated the numbers,steve
31/05/2007 11:34:39	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	(patronizing, sorry)
31/05/2007 11:35:26	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	I dont need them summarized thanks, I just need to know which one you want me to respond to when you say "can katy respond to that please" because there are usually about 3 different points that have been made
31/05/2007 11:35:43	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Blimey - this is hard. Katy do you feel that being asked to negotiate your own assessment would encourage you to try to be instrumental - that is work the assessment in a superficial way to maximise your mark
31/05/2007 11:37:05	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	If theres choice I think that students may choose to "show off" whatever knowledge they have, or skill that they are best at.
31/05/2007 11:37:07	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	Some students, maybe the majority Linda, may be happy with new technology but how do we support/assess those who are not?
31/05/2007 11:37:37	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	OK now lets turn to the question Linda has just posed. Everyone focus please!
31/05/2007 11:37:44	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	And why shouldn't students be assessed on what they are best at?
31/05/2007 11:38:39	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Linda: so in a sense, "we" will never "imagine" all the possibilities - involving the students in creating "new" assessment formats?



31/05/2007 11:38:47	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	It goes back to choices Derek - it doesn't mean we should throw away the traditional modes that are proven to work. A bit like blended learning I suppose - taking the best of both.
31/05/2007 11:39:36	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	having students negotiate their own assessment is great in theory but really difficult in practice especially if there are very large numbers of students. Also as has already been pointed out the desire to staff in your comfort zone is very strong. We are supposed to be challenging students to help them learn (which as we all know is not necessarily a comfortable experience)
31/05/2007 11:39:58	K.P. Jaikiran (jaitvm)	I feel that a right mix of choices of procedures would be more better than individualised assessment formats.
31/05/2007 11:40:13	Darren Matthews (djmatthews)	Are they proven to work, or does an exam for e.g. encourage students to cram at the last minute and only learn/revise what is absolutely necessary?
31/05/2007 11:40:20	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Brenda, Margaret and Katy - any thoughts about this issue of matching assessment to the new forms of social learning?
31/05/2007 11:40:34	Andy Sharp (AndySharp)	Margaret why not use seminars to deal with the numbers issues and get staff to post suggestions on the VLE or equivalent as a way of sharing practice?
31/05/2007 11:40:38	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	Are we limited by the idea that students who have "passed" a particular course should somehow all have acquired the same knowledge/skills from it?
31/05/2007 11:41:29	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	derek this doesn't happen in reality anyway - as students we pick which questions to answer in an exam because we know some areas better than others
31/05/2007 11:41:40	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	MahaBali: We (as tutors) need to learn from the students. We (and our institutions) need to move out of our comfort zone!
31/05/2007 11:41:58	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Katy: and sometimes pass a course without having really understood (happened to me all the time)
31/05/2007 11:42:12	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	If assessment remains the key driver of learning which seems likely then we need to be more adventurous in the method we use including social learning. At the moment we tend to nod at assessing group work but in reality come nowhere near
31/05/2007 11:42:26	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	this gets back to your point earlier - students often can get assessed at what they are best at by ignoring chunks of a course and only answering questions on the parts they know really well
31/05/2007 11:42:41	Andy Sharp (AndySharp)	Linda I totally agree with your point we have to take a good hard look at student involvement in key decision making
31/05/2007 11:42:42	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	I entirely agree Margaret.
31/05/2007 11:42:48	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	MahaBali - Yes I think this can sometimes happen
31/05/2007 11:43:05	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	This seems to me an important point from Margaret
31/05/2007 11:43:26	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	what about students who are more "metacognitive" and more "expressive" - they will "get" what they need; the others will need more help in developing these skills to make choices
31/05/2007 11:43:34	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	How to assess group work?
31/05/2007 11:44:24	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	Yes, I too agree. It reminds me how much more difficult it is for students to peer assess v peer feedback. But that does not mean we should not use peer assessment.
31/05/2007 11:44:30	Geetha Abeysinghe (gka23)	MahaBali: I agree with you totally. Whatever method we choose we need to make sure that all students are well supported. A bit difficult when the class size is large, even if we make use of seminars.



31/05/2007 11:44:31	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	This is where the student involvement and real understanding of assessment purpose and processes is crucial because it seems unlikely that we can assess groupwork without their help and reflection!
31/05/2007 11:44:56	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Good point Margaret
31/05/2007 11:45:17	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	all: do you believe in anonymous peer feedback or should it be known (for responsibility)?
31/05/2007 11:45:26	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	especially if assessment will involve pass/fail
31/05/2007 11:45:31	David Nicol (DavidNicol)	Is it about assessing group working or the ability to produce a good output from learning in a group?
31/05/2007 11:45:34	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Katy - have you ever been assessed for your contribution to group work?
31/05/2007 11:45:36	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	We should also assess the route taken to achieve the outcome of the group work, and allow students to decide which method to use e.g. face to face, VLE discussion board. social networking, texting etc etc. This could be made explicit in their group reports
31/05/2007 11:45:38	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	I think students often struggle with the purpose of assessment. I often hear "they spent all year teaching us about X, but then the essay was about Y"
31/05/2007 11:46:00	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	yes terry, a few years ago.
31/05/2007 11:46:22	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	I found it quite frustrating, I was in a group with people who didn't talk, and so got a bad mark!
31/05/2007 11:46:35	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	Peer marking - it rather depends on the purpose of the exercise. I think it is to develop student ability to assess and self assess it maybe very different if it is just to arrive at a mark
31/05/2007 11:46:42	Mark Russell (MarkRussell)	Katy - that's a great illustration and should remind us all of the values of aligned teaching
31/05/2007 11:47:08	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Mark: and also sharing our philosophy with students
31/05/2007 11:47:38	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	I wonder if it wouldn't make quite a useful start (as Margaret hinted earlier) if we could spend much more time with our students discussing how assessment works AT PRESENT before inviting them to transform it. Do we do enough of this?
31/05/2007 11:47:45	Andy Sharp (AndySharp)	Should group work reflect the realities of the workplace where not everyone contributes equally or should it be in an artificial setting where equality of input and fairness is expected?
31/05/2007 11:47:48	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	i co-teach a course where at the end of the semester, the professor asked students to write a page or two summarizing "why" they think they took the course and how it connects (they were asked what they expected at the beginning)
31/05/2007 11:47:56	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	Linda I think giving them choice is a fab idea. The shy ones who wouldn't talk face to face in my group in class at the moment are the ones who are never off the VLE discussion board. They say more online in an evening than they said to me, face to face all year.
31/05/2007 11:48:00	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	For me peer feedback and peer assessment is about developing a skills as part of lifelong learning. David Carless et al call this sustainable assessment.
31/05/2007 11:48:24	Andy Sharp (AndySharp)	Perhaps group work is more about equipping students for the real world where not everyone plays fair
31/05/2007 11:48:31	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Andy: in the real world, each person is responsible for an individual task that fits with everyone else, right?



31/05/2007 11:48:51	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	OK everyone - I'm going to try to pull this together. We've touched on quite a bit - let me ask the panel members a question. Why do we see so little student engagement in assessment - in whatever form - though in this discussion there is a lot of support for it? First Brenda please?
31/05/2007 11:48:59	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	An interesting point about some studnets responding better on line
31/05/2007 11:49:17	Andy Sharp (AndySharp)	Maha it depends on the setting interdependence is massive especially in a wired world
31/05/2007 11:49:54	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	Andy you are right but students recognise they are in differnet environment and are being assess (they would be4 appraised at work!) but we may also ned to address and award marks for how well student deal with poor group experiences
31/05/2007 11:50:37	Andy Sharp (AndySharp)	Bang on! if we only focus on outcomes we miss the key learning
31/05/2007 11:51:08	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Other panel members - why isn't this happening more widely?
31/05/2007 11:51:09	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	I think some staff are afraid to involve students and so stick toi soem very trad methods that don't engage students. We need to talk more with students about theri experinces and share perceptions
31/05/2007 11:51:33	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	All this just reminds us how bland and uncommunicative about student differences are summative assessments like B-, 86% or upper second!
31/05/2007 11:51:36	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	I think it's because tutors are unwilling to let go of some of their control, and are unwilling to take the risk of empowering students. Institutional cultures don't encourage risk-taking .
31/05/2007 11:51:48	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	I think (and this may sound a bit cynical!) that involveing students means more work in the long run, because it means usually change. I also think there is an issue of credibility/students and their views not being taken seriously by quite a lot of academics.
31/05/2007 11:52:00	K.P. Jaikiran (jaitvm)	There should always be a bottom line to learner choice of assessment procedures. Core areas of assessment need to be fixed.
31/05/2007 11:52:14	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	I'm not sure we don't see engagem,ent but we do see frustration which might stem from a a variety of reason - lack of undertsanding of the process, distrust of the system, poor support for assessment within teaching processes etc
31/05/2007 11:52:18	Darren Matthews (djmatthews)	From a student's perspective, I think students just accept that 'that's the way it is' especially is the era of mass education. From a staff perspective, it involves a lot of work and some are possible quite cautious of these forward thinking ideas.
31/05/2007 11:52:33	radu catalin (karadu)	maybe the solution is to choose an integrated teoretical model for assessment maha?
31/05/2007 11:52:52	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	Better perhaps to think of stuents negotiating (rather than choosing) their assessment?
31/05/2007 11:53:07	Andy Sharp (AndySharp)	Brenda we need to think of ourselves as members of learning communities rather than simply persist with large differences in staus between staff and students. Why am I the limiting factor on what is deemed to be valuable learning it is too restrictive!
31/05/2007 11:53:08	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	Good word
31/05/2007 11:53:13	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Now let me ask the participants this. Where would you start?



31/05/2007 11:53:27	Geetha Abeysinghe (gka23)	Hi All, Thanks you very much for a very interesting session. I laready have my next assessment in mind: Ask students to choose a topic (give a few example), they need to provide 2-3 things they expect to learn, get them peer reviewed. the process should be tutor monitored with occasional compulsory formative feedabck to avoid plagiarism.
31/05/2007 11:53:30	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	well, it is kind of revolutionary and will take time to get adopted by slow-academic (non risk-taking institutions)
31/05/2007 11:54:07	Sheila MacNeill (Sheila (Moderator))	We've got about 5 minutes left of this scheduled session, Terry would you like to start to round things up? Remember there is the discussion board to continue the debate.
31/05/2007 11:54:08	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	karadu and Derek: good ideas!
31/05/2007 11:54:33	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	Great start, gja23! Good luck!
31/05/2007 11:54:37	Andy Sharp (AndySharp)	Maha we need to constantly revisit the purpose of the academic communities if we see value in knowledge creation we can perhaps be less resistant to change
31/05/2007 11:54:52	Geetha Abeysinghe (gka23)	Thank you, Derek.
31/05/2007 11:55:17	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	Andy: agree
31/05/2007 11:55:34	radu catalin (karadu)	'slow-academic' are intersted to assess their results
31/05/2007 11:55:53	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	Andy - absolutely agree. They should be dynamic entities with fluidity of memebship and students will be able to come in and take part in the devlopment
31/05/2007 11:56:12	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	I don't think I've had such a frantic hour in front off the computer since I stopped playing Space Invaders!
31/05/2007 11:56:17	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	OK we have focused on the difficulties I think, rather than the benefits. There seems to be broad agreement in the position statements, and throughout this discussion that it is necessary to enage studnets in discussion about the fundamental purpose of assessing them, so the details can be negotiated on the basis of a shared - aligned - understanding of why it is being domne
31/05/2007 11:56:19	radu catalin (karadu)	Andy - agree
31/05/2007 11:56:45	Maha Bali (MahaBali)	derek lol
31/05/2007 11:57:09	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	A chat room certainly puts our typing skills to the test!
31/05/2007 11:57:10	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	I guess the benefit (to students) is chiefly one of motivation.
31/05/2007 11:57:24	K.P. Jaikiran (jaitvm)	Good bye from india to all
31/05/2007 11:57:39	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	my tying is beginning to fall apart. let me give the lasat word to the panel. Please - any of the panel memberes. What is the main point to emerge for you - and what would you like to see continued in the forum later?
31/05/2007 11:57:42	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	Goodbye India!
31/05/2007 11:57:48	Mark Russell (MarkRussell)	Motivation - Which might also stem from inclusion and being valued
31/05/2007 11:57:50	radu catalin (karadu)	Bye jaitvm
31/05/2007 11:57:57	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	derek, and finding greater meaning in their assessment and studies



31/05/2007 11:58:06	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	Very true, Mark
31/05/2007 11:58:21	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	I agree Terry. I think the most important step towards this is to open the negotiations and talk to the students!
31/05/2007 11:58:29	Derek Rowntree (DerekRowntree)	...and Margaret!
31/05/2007 11:58:53	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	I would like to see us developing a community of practice with both staff and students
31/05/2007 11:58:57	Mark Russell (MarkRussell)	Linda to or with?
31/05/2007 11:59:06	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	Main point for me is the student need to be part of the community they have joined
31/05/2007 11:59:19	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	Sorry, with ..
31/05/2007 11:59:29	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Last word to Katy?
31/05/2007 11:59:55	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	personally I'm going to lie down in a darkened room now.
31/05/2007 12:00:13	Linda Creanor (LindaCreanor)	Exhausting, isn't it?!
31/05/2007 12:00:15	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	Who said chat rooms were easy!
31/05/2007 12:00:23	Margaret Price (Margaret Price)	A blatant plug - our CETL ASKe is investigating the cultivation of community focusing on bringing student in, being more involved
31/05/2007 12:00:26	Katy McCloskey (KatyMc)	its really good to see that you all want to encourage talking to students. Unfortunately this view isn't always shared by your fellow academics, and its their -ve views of student opinions and their worth that often create a barrier between students and academics
31/05/2007 12:00:46	radu catalin (karadu)	staff, students and graduated students
31/05/2007 12:00:50	Terry Mayes (Terry Mayes)	Good point to stop on. Thanks everybody and thanks to the panel.
31/05/2007 12:00:55	David Nicol (DavidNicol)	Would DerekR and MahaB check their email please after this session.
31/05/2007 12:01:00	Brenda Smith (Brenda Smith)	Lets go work on those staff and encourage them
31/05/2007 12:01:07	Sheila MacNeill (Sheila (Moderator))	I'd like to close this session firstly thanking our (exhausted) chair and expert panel, and to all of you for your contributions. Remember you can continue the discussions or post any unanswered questions into the discussion board. Thanks again.

- TRANSCRIPT ENDS -

This work has been made available as part of the REAP International Online Conference 29-31 May 2007

Re-Engineering Assessment Practices in Scottish Higher Education (REAP) is funded by the Scottish Funding Council under its e-Learning Transformation initiative. Further information about REAP can be found at <http://www.reap.ac.uk>